

**To:** CN=Barbara Butler/OU=CI/O=USEPA/C=US@EPA[]  
**Cc:** []  
**Bcc:** []  
**From:** CN=Phil North/OU=R10/O=USEPA/C=US  
**Sent:** Mon 11/28/2011 9:13:29 PM  
**Subject:** Re: Fw: Lifespan of Tailings Dams  
<http://ithinkmining.com/2011/02/25/long-term-stability-of-closed-mine-tailings-piles-how-so-at-pebble/>

Hi Barb,

I don't know if PLP has sought Jack Caldwell's advice on anything. I have never heard of him as one of their consultants.

**Ex. 5 - Deliberative**

## **Ex. 5 - Deliberative**

In regard to your 11/14 on TSF G, I think you are looking at the proposal associated with the water rights application from 2005. That is an old mine plan from when the deposit was believed to be much small. They had not found Pebble East yet. TSF G is smaller in that proposal.

Phil

Phillip North  
Environmental Protection Agency  
Kenai River Center  
514 Funny River Road  
Soldotna, Alaska 99669  
(907) 714-2483  
fax 260-5992  
[north.phil@epa.gov](mailto:north.phil@epa.gov)

"To protect your rivers, protect your mountains."

**From:** Barbara Butler/CI/USEPA/US  
**To:** Phil North/R10/USEPA/US@EPA  
**Date:** 11/28/2011 05:39 AM  
**Subject:** Re: Fw: Lifespan of Tailings Dams

Hi Phil,

I have read some of Jack's blogs and he provides much good insight. It is good that although he takes a critical view of issues within the industry, they also respect him. Do you know if his input has been sought by the Pebble folks?

# **Ex. 5 - Deliberative**

Cheers,  
Barb

---

Barbara A. Butler, PhD  
Research Physical Scientist  
US EPA-ORD-NRMRL-LRPCD-RRB  
26 W. Martin Luther King Drive, MS 489  
Cincinnati, OH 45268  
Phone: (513) 569-7468  
Fax: (513) 569-7620  
Temporary Office Location: WB21D

From: Phil North/R10/USEPA/US  
To: Barbara Butler/CI/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 11/23/2011 01:31 PM  
Subject: Fw: Lifespan of Tailings Dams

Barbara,  
I think I sent this to you but just came across it again. Jack is the one who expressed concern at the conference about long term. He seems very well respected in the industry.

Phillip North  
Environmental Protection Agency  
Kenai River Center  
514 Funny River Road  
Soldotna, Alaska 99669  
(907) 714-2483  
fax 260-5992  
north.phil@epa.gov

"To protect your rivers, protect your mountains."  
----- Forwarded by Phil North/R10/USEPA/US on 11/23/2011 09:30 AM -----

From: Bob <bdrop@epa.gov>  
To: Phil North/R10/USEPA/US@EPA  
Date: 08/17/2011 02:15 PM  
Subject: Lifespan of Tailings Dams

Phil –  
Interesting short article on the lifespan of tailings impoundments.

<http://ithinkmining.com/2011/02/25/long-term-stability-of-closed-mine-tailings-piles-how-so-at-pebble/>